



## Early Journal Content on JSTOR, Free to Anyone in the World

This article is one of nearly 500,000 scholarly works digitized and made freely available to everyone in the world by JSTOR.

Known as the Early Journal Content, this set of works include research articles, news, letters, and other writings published in more than 200 of the oldest leading academic journals. The works date from the mid-seventeenth to the early twentieth centuries.

We encourage people to read and share the Early Journal Content openly and to tell others that this resource exists. People may post this content online or redistribute in any way for non-commercial purposes.

Read more about Early Journal Content at <http://about.jstor.org/participate-jstor/individuals/early-journal-content>.

JSTOR is a digital library of academic journals, books, and primary source objects. JSTOR helps people discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content through a powerful research and teaching platform, and preserves this content for future generations. JSTOR is part of ITHAKA, a not-for-profit organization that also includes Ithaka S+R and Portico. For more information about JSTOR, please contact [support@jstor.org](mailto:support@jstor.org).

past is opened and made to live again, in which the ancient prophet speaks as if still alive" (p. 263).

The author makes unquestioned use of Ezekiel's allusion to Daniel (p. 298). In the note on Ezek. 14:14 he dismisses forthwith the proposed emendation of "Enoch" for "Daniel," a correction which Cheyne pronounces to be certainly necessary, and which has so much in its favor that the building on Ezekiel's mention of Daniel is surely precarious.

L. W. BATTEN.

NEW YORK, N. Y.

ZUR GENESIS DER AGADA. Beitrag zur Entstehungs- und Entwicklungsgeschichte des talmudischen Schriftthums. Von N. I. WEINSTEIN. II. Theil: *Die alexandrinische Agada*.<sup>1</sup> Göttingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, 1901. Pp. 275. M. 7.

THE identity of the talmudic *minim* has exercised the ingenuity of scholars since the time of Elias Levita. In the face of a categorical declaration of the Palestinian Talmud that **לֹא גִלּוּ יִשְׂרָאֵל עַד שֶׁנִּנְעֲשֶׂר** **כִּדְ כְּתוּבָה שֶׁל מִיִּנִים** (*Sanhedr.*, X, 5), pains have been taken to recognize in them exclusively now one, now another heresy. They were thus identified in turn with the Manichæans, Zarathustrians, Jewish Christians, Hellenists, etc. In 1898 Friedländer entered the lists of this somewhat futile tournament with a book entitled *Der vorchristliche jüdische Gnosticismus*,<sup>2</sup> in which he maintained with considerable sagacity and spirit that the *Mínim* are no other than Antinomian Jewish Gnostics, who formed the radical wing of Hellenistic Judaism. This was an amplification and defense of a former essay of his in which the importance of those Jews for the universalizing of Judaism was defended sympathetically and ably, though perhaps not in a way to carry conviction.<sup>3</sup> Our author enters upon Friedländer's work with the easy conscience of an ancient Israelite spoiling an Egyptian, not, however, before mutilating the original idea almost beyond recognition. For while Friedländer draws an important distinction between the conservative majority and the radical minority, Dr. Weinstein speaks unqualifiedly of Alexandrian Judaism, and in this way what was at least plausible becomes now preposterous.

<sup>1</sup> Part I will appear in 1902.

<sup>2</sup> See CLEMEN'S review in this JOURNAL, Vol. IV (1900), pp. 164, 165.

<sup>3</sup> *Das Judenthum in der vorchristlichen jüdischen Welt*. See this JOURNAL, Vol. II (1898), pp. 213, 214.

We are asked to believe, on "evidence" concocted out of a preposterous manipulation of texts, that the entire Hellenistic Jewish diaspora was a hotbed of apostasy from monotheism; that a ditheistic Logos-worship flourished in regularly organized synagogues, and even infested many Palestinian cities; that those apostates annoyed the students, pestered the authorities, and, what is worst, actually made secret converts among the foremost teachers of the law and bearers of the tradition, who thus under the cloak of outward sanctity harbored the demon of heresy, whose tail and horns peep out here and there in the numerous agadic passages and reveal to the discerning eye of Dr. Weinstein their true identity as Alexandrian, Philonic, Logos-ridden, ditheistic; for all these terms are interchangeable to our author. The Jewish authorities could not, of course, tolerate such horrors, and, in their contest with them, had to resort to some severely repressive measures. Needless to say that all this is a pure hashish dream. Anyone who has read the Midrash intelligently and observed the perfect *insouciance* with which poetry, humor, shrewdness, whimsicality, and fanciful exegesis combine to form the quaintest and most fascinating arabesques, as innocent of metaphysics as of bigoted pedantry, will laugh at the desperate efforts of Weinstein to convict these delightful preachers of awful heresies.

But we must hasten to another point. Our author offers a novel solution of the etymology of מִנְיָ. Our heretics are no other than the Arabian tribe of the Minæi, with whom Dozy in the *Die Israeliten zu Mekka* identifies the Simeonites. After a lengthy argument our author feels that he has definitively settled this point. We can do no more than give the gist of his argument. The Simeonites were never of much account or importance. A comparison of their census before and after the plague (Numb. 25:9) shows the greatest numerical loss, because they were the most egregious offenders. Small wonder, then, that the descendants of these reprobates, so wantonly susceptible to the charms of the Moabitish maidens, fell victims some thousand years later to the metaphysical charms of a ditheistic Logos-worship. After locating them, within a few pages, successively in Arabia, in Arabia Petrea, and in Arabia Felix—our author is very light-hearted in matters geographical—he makes them gradually migrate to southern Palestine, where they mingle with the population and pervert the agadists of the South. Cæsarea, which lies south of Jerusalem, in fact on the southern coast of the Mediterranean (p. 167)—this, by the way, is based on the authority of a passage in the Palest. Talmud, given in

a footnote, speaking of the Cæsarean harbor!—as well as Lydda (Diospolis), swarm with them. But they are also found in other places, and are everywhere the cause of much mischief, of heartburnings, of patriarchal severities, and of the insidious heresies of the "Alexandrian" agada. Space forbids to do more than draw attention to a plagiarism (pp. 125, 126) from Jellinek (*cf.* Beth Ha-Midrash, III); to some peculiar remarks on Hebrew grammar (pp. 219–23); to a sample of our author's Greek (γένικος ἄνθρωπος = "der sinnliche Mensch"); or to his fondness for "proving" well-known commonplaces. These are mere trifles when compared with the habit of disingenuousness with which texts are altered and twisted so as to testify falsely in behalf of a pet theory. For example see pp. 75, note 110; 84, note 133; 167, note 31; 168, note 34; 213, note 163; 247, note 228; 255, note 4; 260, note 7; 261, note 10; 264, note 19.

We hope not to exaggerate in saying that such "contributions" belong to the debit side of the ledger, and that a fair number of them will rapidly land any science in the hands of a receiver.

EPHRAIM FELDMAN.

HEBREW UNION COLLEGE,  
Cincinnati, O.

---

#### HANDBOOK TO THE TEXTUAL CRITICISM OF THE NEW TESTAMENT.

By FREDERIC G. KENYON. With Sixteen Facsimiles. New York: Macmillan, 1901. Pp. xi + 321. \$3.25, net.

DR. KENYON has been assistant keeper of manuscripts at the British Museum since 1889. He has made himself well known wherever Greek letters are cultivated, by his editions of papyrus texts deposited in the British Museum, and by his *Catalogue of Greek Papyri in the British Museum*, published in two volumes, issued, respectively, in 1893 and 1898. The results of his study of the papyri he has summed up also in an excellent sketch of *The Palæography of Greek Papyri*, published in 1899. His interest in the biblical text has shown itself in an admirable popular volume on *Our Bible and the Ancient Manuscripts*, which reached its third edition in 1898, and in a series of *Facsimiles of Biblical Manuscripts in the British Museum* which appeared in 1900. The treatise which he now gives us profits, of course, from his long and close occupation with Greek diplomatics.

The book is divided into eight chapters. The first of these is a brief introductory precis of "the function of textual criticism." The next three give a full account of the Greek manuscripts preserving